

February 7, 2023

Design Review Narrative for CHC Puyallup Cannery Medical & Dental Clinic
201 W Main, Puyallup, WA

The alterations proposed for the Cannery building located at 201 W Main in Puyallup, Washington include preserving the existing façade and design elements across all the elevations, with minor improvements for programmatic needs.

The existing entry breezeway, further noted in the responses below as the “Sound Transit Breezeway” is an easement on the CHC property for Sound Transit to maintain and provide ingress and egress for the transit station north of the property. Any work within the breezeway is responsibility of Sound Transit.

CHC is determined to maintain and enhance the existing character of the Cannery, while allowing for their programmatic needs to be accommodated.

PART 1. Introduction

1.B.1 Applicability: In the CBD, CBD-Core, and RM-Core zones, any exterior work or new building square footage requiring a building permit may be subject design review according to the Downtown Design Guidelines based on the following thresholds:

RESPONSE: *The Design Guidelines should be considered applicable since the proposed renovations and addition are within the CBD-Core – Central Business District, the alterations include painting 100% of the exterior elevations and the building was constructed in 1906, 43 years prior to 1949.*

1.B.3 Properties listed on Historic Registers

RESPONSE: *The property does not fall on any Historic Registers per Appendix 6.A.*

PART 2. Significant Buildings

2.A Design Intent for Significant Buildings: Some buildings in Puyallup’s downtown are of particular historic significance or character. “Character structures” include buildings and structures that were constructed prior to 1949. Renovations and/or additions should be consistent with the building’s time period and original design.

RESPONSE: *The Cannery building is considered a “Character Structure” per Downtown Design Guidelines, as it was originally constructed in 1906 and known most commonly as a Cannery for Valley Packers. During an alterations project in 2004, much off the original façade and elements were either removed or relocated to be converted to office space. A handful of character elements were preserved and restored, including the sugar tower, the barn doors, and a majority of the overall building form/roof lines. Some of the additions to the building during the 2004 renovations included exterior egress stairs that are currently in poor condition and in need of replacement and/or removal. The proposed*

alterations will remove one of the exterior stairs and replace and enclose the other exterior stair with respect to the original structure.

2.B Design Guidelines and Strategies

2.B.1 Applicability and Requirements

- 4. When renovating an existing character structure, keep existing exterior materials and architectural elements, where possible. - **RESPONSE:** *The Cannery building preserves all existing siding by repainting. At the East Façade there is an additional exterior door at the first floor that will be removed and infilled with siding to match existing. At the North Façade where an existing exterior door is to be removed and replaced a new window will be installed to match the style & scale of the existing windows*

5. Maintain design forms, elements, and materials consistent with the character structure. When new elements are applied, such as pedestrian weather protection, the new building element may be modified as necessary to maintain the integrity of the historic architecture.

RESPONSE: *The Cannery building makes no modification to the design form or materials. Additional pedestrian weather protection is not included in the scope but included in the original construction.*

6. Identify and incorporate dimensions and/or forms of the character structure for use in any new addition(s) to the structure.

RESPONSE: *The exterior stair on the North Façade is in poor condition and in need of replacement. An addition is proposed that will enclose a new stair and be complimentary to the existing character of the Cannery building in materiality and form. We have proposed a roof slope that matches the existing building roof slope, at a slightly lower elevation to preserve the existing overall building rooflines.*

7. Maintain and reinforce the historic character by using appropriate materials, patterns, forms, and detailing of all elements of the building.

RESPONSE: *High quality materials consistent with the character structure will be used at the addition. We propose using a material that would be reminiscent of historic warehouse and barn structures of the pacific northwest. We chose a vertical wood shiplap siding that is stained to a brown finish. Existing siding will be repainted and where replaced reinstalled to match.*

8. Identify 2-3 architectural elements or dimension lines that tie older, existing buildings to new buildings.

RESPONSE: *We have incorporated a datum line in the enclosure at mid-elevation that emulates the existing "belly band" of the Cannery structure. We propose adding two new windows to this façade, that proportionally match the Cannery windows, with a high-quality dark bronze aluminum window frame.*

9. Provide a transition between old and new buildings by accepting some shared building elements and architectural features.

RESPONSE: *The east and west facades of the new addition will have a matching siding profile to the Cannery and will be painted in a dark grey to help blend the connection between the existing and new addition.*

2.B.2 Renovations: Maintain the overall character and scale of character structures, while updating projects to current code requirements.

RESPONSE: *The Cannery building preserves all existing proportions and massing. There are no modifications to the form modulation and existing façade materials are preserved with a new coat of paint. The roof forms are not modified in any way and a matching window style will be utilized where a door is to be demolished and infilled on the North façade.*

2.B.3 Additions: Reflect and reinforce the overall historic character when adding new square footage to the side, rear, or top of an existing character structure.

RESPONSE: *At the existing exterior egress stair, where we propose removing this stair and replacing it with an enclosed stairway, we have incorporated a datum line in the enclosure at mid-elevation that emulates the existing “belly band” of the Cannery structure. The east and west facades of the addition will have a matching siding profile to the Cannery, to be painted in a dark grey to help blend the connection between the existing and new structures, what we’re referring to as the “gasket”. We have proposed a roof slope that matches the existing building roof slope, at a slightly lower elevation to preserve the existing overall building rooflines. A high-quality vertical wood shiplap siding material that is reminiscent of historic warehouse and barn structures of the pacific northwest will also be utilized on the addition’s North façade.*

PART 3. Building Design – Form and Massing

3.A. Design Intent for Downtown Building Form and Massing

RESPONSE: *The proposed design illustrated in this packet promotes a lively, vibrant, welcoming pedestrian experience in the Central Business District that respects the existing city’s urban fabric. The main street corridor will effectively expand west with the renovation of this historic piece of architecture, increasing pedestrian activity and reinforcing the city’s unique past as intended by this section.*

3.B. Design Guidelines and Strategies

3.B.1. Applicability and Requirements

1B. Renovation projects defined as buildings 4,000 square feet or greater, before or after construction.

RESPONSE: *The design guidelines and strategies are applicable as this project seeks to renovate approximately 27,000 sqft.*

3.B.2. Site and Neighborhood Context: Determine appropriate building form and/or modulation of building massing for the site.

1. Size of Lot – **RESPONSE:** 24,092 sqft
2. Scale of Lot Relative to Adjacent Lots – **RESPONSE:** *The lot is similar in size to its eastern neighbor and substantially smaller than the lot surrounding it on the north and west.*
3. Scale of Neighboring Buildings - **RESPONSE:** *The proposed design meets the 1-2 story scale of the neighboring buildings along the pedestrian orientated street in the CBD-Core zone the building was built in.*

4. Proximity to Character Structures and/or historic buildings - **RESPONSE:** *Built shortly after the Cannery Pihl Brother's Building is the closest historic structure at around 1 block away. The Pihl Brother's building is a two story structure with much of its original detailing still intact. Similarly the proposed design for the Cannery maintains its 2 story massing and historic detailing. More modern details will be reserved for the North Elevation tucked away from Main Street.*
5. Relationship to Transition Zones and Whether additional upper level setbacks might be warranted - **RESPONSE:** *The historic massing will be maintained.*
6. Relationship to Solar Access and potential of shadow impacts - **RESPONSE:** *No changes to the historic massing are proposed.*

3.B.3. Building Scale and Bulk: To reduce the scale of large buildings relative to their context, consider the articulation of building form with all or some of the following strategies:.

1. Break a large building into smaller masses, elements, and forms using horizontal or vertical offsets and/or changes in materials. – **RESPONSE:** *The historic massing of the building remains intact and will go unchanged with the exception of the added modest stair enclosure on the North Elevation.*
2. If larger massing is necessary to achieve development goals, changes in materials and variation in windows and other devices are required to reduce the scale of the larger building mass– **RESPONSE:** *The historic massing of the building is being maintained and is already well varied. In addition, variations in fenestrations occur frequently around the entire perimeter of the building.*

3.B.4. Height

RESPONSE: *The massing of the historic 2 story building will remain intact and no alterations will affect residential and transitions zones, adjacent historic and/or character structures, adjacent civic spaces, or shadow impacts on pedestrian streets.*

3.B.5. Setbacks

1. Step back a new building where appropriate. – **RESPONSE:** *The building is not immediately adjacent to residential zones, historic and/or character structures or civic spaces.*
2. Any building greater than three (3) floors or 35 feet in height (whichever is less) will provide minimum setbacks and incorporate exterior porches. -**RESPONSE:** *The historic massing of the building is below 35'-0" and an exterior porch will be retained from the previous construction.*
3. A building with a height greater than the street right-of-way width it fronts upon should incorporate a setback either at the second level or top level of the building in order to reduce the sense of mass of the building. -. **RESPONSE:** *The right of way is 60'-0" and the building height is below 35'-0" therefore this criteria is not applicable.*

3.B.6. Modulation of Building Form

1. Horizontal Patterns, reinforce the horizontal character of adjacent structures. – **RESPONSE:** *The following strategies to reinforce the horizontal character of the building have been considered. The building's 2 story height will be maintained along with the low slope of the existing roof forms pitched at approximately 2:12. A ground level set back was incorporated into the original design with the covered Sound Transit Breezeway.*
2. Corner Building - **RESPONSE:** *This guideline is not applicable as this is not a corner building.*

3. Roof Articulation - **RESPONSE:** *The existing low pitch roof slope will be maintained. Cornices and parapet articulation are not included in this design as these additions would not be in keeping with the light industrial nature of the historic construction.*
4. Development Adjacent to Historic or Character Structures provide a transition between old and new buildings by incorporating some shared building elements and architectural features. New, larger projects have the following options for establishing a transition to adjacent or abutting older and smaller structures.
 - a. Detailing of new projects should incorporate 2-3 forms, materials, details, and/or other building elements present in adjacent transitional zones to achieve consistency along street frontages. - **RESPONSE:** *There are no additions on the South façade adjacent to the pedestrian-oriented street frontage. However, the stair well enclosure addition at the North façade fronting the Sound Transit Station utilizes matching siding profile to the Cannery at the east and west facades of the addition, to be painted in a dark grey to help blend the connection between existing and new structures. We propose adding two new windows to this façade, that proportionally match the Cannery windows, with a high-quality dark bronze aluminum window frame.*
 - b. Incorporate horizontal or vertical dimensions, and/or proportions that reference or reflect older existing buildings within the block - **RESPONSE:** *We propose using a material on north façade of the new enclosed stair that would be reminiscent of historic warehouse and barn structures of the pacific northwest. We chose a vertical wood shiplap siding that is stained to a brown finish.*
 - c. Incorporate scale elements in the new building form(s) and/or elements that can be seen in older existing buildings within the downtown core. - **RESPONSE:** *Our proposed design maintains the 2-story historic structure, and historically proportional windows common to the CBD - Core.*

3.B.7. Exterior Public Space, Interior Galleria or Arcade Space

1. Create active, pedestrian friendly civic gathering spaces adjacent to large buildings for seasonal use and associated building activities. – **RESPONSE:** *The covered accessible entry or Sound Transit Breezeway will provide year round outdoor public space.*
2. Enhance and expand upon pedestrian weather protection through the inclusion of seating areas and adjacent landscape features to create a lively civic outdoor environment. – **RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breeze way will be maintained and improved with the exterior work planned including a full repainting of the facility. The Sound Transit Breezeway is an easement on the 201 W. Main property, new furniture and alterations will require Sound Transit Approval.*
3. Arrange massing to offset increased height where feasible. Do not place civic spaces on the north side of multi- story, large building projects. - **RESPONSE:** *The historic 2-story massing will be maintained and no civic space on the north side of the building is planned.*
4. For all new or renovation projects of 10,000 square feet or greater (before or after construction), provide 5-10% of the building's total gross square footage of retail and commercial space to serve as exterior public plaza, expanded sidewalk zone(s), interior arcade, or galleria space. -**RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breezeway is a covered public access point just under 10% of the total buildings enclosed square footage and will be maintained and improved being part of the general exterior improvements the design requires.*

5. Provide for midblock pedestrian walkways at full-block developments that are 200'x200' or larger. - **RESPONSE:** *This guideline does not apply as this is not a full block development.*

PART 5. Pedestrian Experience.

5.A. Design Intent for Downtown Pedestrian Area

RESPONSE: *Visual interest will be enhanced with the proposed exterior improvements including the repainting of the entire building. The existing city provided sidewalk lighting will remain untouched and continue to provide the same level of safety as initially designed. In addition, signage will be introduced on the East façade to reduce the impact of blank walls.*

5.B. Design Guidelines and Strategies

5.B.1. Applicability and Requirements

1. This section applies to all new construction and additions. - **RESPONSE:** *This section is applicable as a minor addition is being incorporated onto the North Façade to enclose an existing exterior stair.*
2. Façade improvements to building located on pedestrian-oriented streets are subject to sections 5.B.3 and 5.B.5. - **RESPONSE:** *As this project falls within the downtown business district and given its proximity to the Sounder Transit Station it is understood that Main Street is a pedestrian oriented street and this section will be applicable to the project.*

5.B.2. Wayfinding Elements and Strategies. Recommended at all street-facing facades.

1. Consider some or all of the following strategies
 - a. Special building massing forms - **RESPONSE:** *The historic 2-story massing will remain unchanged.*
 - b. Façade composition - **RESPONSE:** *The existing south façade along W Main will remain unchanged with the exception of added louvers, and a refresh of paint.*
 - c. Weather protection at the primary entry - **RESPONSE:** *The primary entry is located off of the Sound Transit Breezeway and is well protected from the elements.*
 - d. Lighting - **RESPONSE:** *The existing exterior building lighting is proposed to be replaced with a "barn" style lighting family, seen throughout the elevation drawings provided. The Sound Transit Breezeway will be outfitted with new recessed lights.*
 - e. Signage - **RESPONSE:** *We propose relocating one of the character barn doors from the second floor of the North Facade to the East Façade, and painting signage onto it that will appear historic with distressing techniques.*
2. Use prominent visual/physical form(s) to assist with wayfinding in the urban environment. - **RESPONSE:** *The historic breezeway will remain untouched as a visual cue to located the primary entry.*
3. Reinforce larger, important civic spaces and places through the articulation of building forms, elements, and massing. - **RESPONSE:** *The historic breezeway will continue to act a circulation path from the Sound Transit Station to W Main Street.*
4. Reinforce the horizontal character of abutting structures using cornice and weather protection elements. - **RESPONSE:** *The historic breezeway and porch strongly reinforce the horizontal character of the adjacent structures.*

5. Signage bands or stand-alone signs can be standard flat sign panels or incorporated into a more artistic logo created through the use of sculptural elements (also refer to City of Puyallup Sign Code). - **RESPONSE:** *We propose relocating one of the character barn doors from the second floor of the North Façade to the East Façade, and painting signage onto it that will appear historic with distressing techniques.*

5.B.3. Ground Level Transparency.

RESPONSE: *The circulation to the primary entry is located in the Sound Transit Breezeway which will be outfitted with new lighting and repainted. The primary entry door is glazed with existing 2'-0" relites on either side. As this building falls within the character structure designation the guidelines for Part 2 are observed and the 60% transparency requirement is understood to not apply.*

5.B.4. Building Entries. Enhance public safety while reducing opportunities for vandalism. Building entries include commercial building entries, residential building entries, garage entries, fire exits, and service/utility access.

1. Align primary building entries with pedestrian points of access. Consider transit stops, cross walks, public open spaces, and/or building design (massing and façade) strategies. - **RESPONSE:** *The primary entry will remain untouched and be located along the Sound Transit Breezeway which connects the Sound Transit Station to the CBD-Core.*
2. Avoid Locating garage entries and building services (utility and/or trash rooms) along the primary pedestrian façade. - **RESPONSE:** *The waste enclosure and additional proposed location for (2) new mechanical ODU's will be located adjacent to the North Façade/property line and will be well out of the way of the primary entry at the East Façade and the pedestrian-oriented street facing South Façade.*
3. Primary building entries and lobbies:
 - a. Provide defined path to building entry from public sidewalk - **RESPONSE:** *The existing Sound Transit Breezeway uses massing to provide a well-defined path to the building entry.*
 - b. Consider how façade design, weather protection, lighting, signage and site design (hardscaping and landscaping) contribute to the building entry experience. **RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breeze way will be lined with Cornus 'Starlight'/Starlight Dogwood along the eastern elevation to screen the pedestrian experience from the parking and provide pleasant dappled morning light.*
 - c. Building Entries and Lobbies should include high quality materials. **RESPONSE:** *The building entry and lobby will be provided with a high-quality linear wood ceiling which opens to a double height vertical circulation space adjacent to a new timber and steel stair.*
4. Residential unit (or building) entries should provide a visual transition from the sidewalk. - **RESPONSE:** *Not applicable.*
5. Provide screens, rolling doors, or other devices to reduce or eliminate small recessed/sheltered areas at non-public doorways where loitering and/or vandalism could occur. - **RESPONSE:** *The existing non-public covered porch on the West Façade is large making the use of screens and rolling doors impractical. This area and the public breezeway on the East facade are therefore protected with multiple Security IP Video Camera's.*
6. Incorporate Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) principles in the design of a building's ground level and surrounding site areas. - **RESPONSE:** *"Eye's on the Street" is a CPTED principal inherent in the existing construction given*

the large number of street facing windows. In addition, new exterior wall mounted fixtures will be installed at all entries and along the covered porch.

5.B.5. Pedestrian Weather Protection

1. Pedestrian weather protection is required at:
 - a. Adjacent to transit stops.
 - b. Properties located in the CBD-Core zone.
2. Proposed weather protection should meet the following strategies:
 - a. High quality materials. - **RESPONSE:** *The existing covered entry is provided by the overhung second story of the building and therefore qualifies as a high quality material.*
 - b. 5-foot minimum depth. Breaks or notches may be necessary to accommodate street lights, light poles, etc. - **RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breezeway is 17'-0" wide exceeding the 5'-0" minimum requirement.*
 - c. Continuous sidewalk coverage should be utilized to the furthest extent possible for properties located in the CBD-Core zone. - **RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breezeway runs along the full East Façade of the building.*
 - d. Canopies and awnings should be designed to a size, shape and module to fit and enhance the buildings articulation and fenestrations. - **RESPONSE:** *Being a result of the existing massing the Sound Transit Breezeway is integral to the building and therefore covers no existing ornamentation.*
 - e. Canopies - **RESPONSE:** *Not applicable as no new canopies are proposed.*
 - f. Awnings - **RESPONSE:** *The existing awning has open ends and is considered a 'shed awning' meeting the requirements outlined in the section.*
 - g. Transit Stops: When transit stops are abutting the site, provide seating and weather protection as part of the facade and/ or sidewalk design (coordinate with Pierce Transit). - **RESPONSE:** *The Sound Transit Breezeway falls outside of the scope of project as it occurs on a Sound Transit easement and within that authority's jurisdiction. Any additional seating to be provided at the breezeway will be the responsibility of Sound Transit via an easement on this property.*

5.B.6. Lighting

RESPONSE: *The existing exterior building lighting is proposed to be replaced with a "barn" style lighting family, seen throughout the elevation drawings provided. This includes lighting at all entries and under the covered awning/porch on the West Façade. The Sound Transit Breezeway will be outfitted with new recessed lights as well.*

5.B.7. Signage

RESPONSE: *At the second floor along the North façade where we will remove the exterior stair and door, we propose relocating the character barn door to the East Façade. This relocated barn door will be painted with signage that will appear historic with distressing techniques.*

5.B.8. Blank Wall Treatment – Street Facing Facades. Improve the pedestrian experience by reducing the visual impact of blank walls through the use of embellishment, particularly along sidewalks.

1. Avoid blank walls along sidewalks and pedestrian areas. - **RESPONSE:** *The existing south façade along W Main will remain unchanged with the exception of added louvers, and a refresh of paint. These walls will retain their historic character,*

detailing, and fenestration. The west side of the South Façade is capped with an awning/porch and to the east is the Sound Transit Breezeway massing cutout providing additional character and interest.

2. Incorporate multiple materials and a varied layout within any facades containing walls without modulation over 30 feet in length or 400 square feet in area to create visual interest. **RESPONSE:** *The street facing walls contains 3 materials with two accent materials: painted trim and glass. The accent materials account for more than 20% of the area of the wall.*

5.B.9. Strategies for Parking Garage Entrances and Parking Structures.

RESPONSE: *Not applicable as a parking garage is not included in this proposal.*

Lastly, we have an alternate proposal where the existing north exterior egress stair will be replaced in-kind, without an enclosure. We have included elevation drawings showing this alternate proposal for consideration.

Miller Hayashi Architects and CHC are pleased to present our design review package in hopes that the proposed alterations to the existing Cannery structure are seen as complimentary and respectful of the existing character of the Cannery, while allowing for the new elements to be respected in their own right.

Sincerely,



Ellen Hagen
Principal

Miller Hayashi Architects
ellenhagen@millerhayashi.com
206-634-0177